

CHM 403 Critique of Peer Review

Author Names _____

Review #1 – Reviewer _____

(Each section will be scored on a scale of 0-3)

_____ Completeness (all sections reviewed?)

_____ Constructive comments (are the comments helpful?)

_____ Depth of critique (is the critique thorough?)

Review #2 – Reviewer _____

_____ Completeness (all sections reviewed?)

_____ Constructive comments (are the comments helpful?)

_____ Depth of critique (is the critique thorough?)

_____ Total

Author's Name: _____

Reviewer's Name: _____

Reviewer's Notes for Peer Review of Inorganic Lab Reports

Title:

- ☐ missing
- ☐ not specific enough
- ☐ should not just be experiment title from lab manual
- ☐ should not be a sentence
- ☐ should not be on separate page

Author:

- ☐ missing

Institution:

- ☐ missing

Date:

- ☐ missing (even rough draft should have a date)
- ☐ should be date of submission of paper, not of experiment

Abstract:

- ☐ missing
- ☐ result must be given
- ☐ save details for elsewhere

Introduction :

- ☐ missing
- ☐ background not well established
- ☐ general introductory remarks should be made
- ☐ save experimental details for next section

Experimental :

- ☐ missing
- ☐ don't include results here

Results and Discussion:

- ☐ missing
- ☐ put experimental method in previous section

Figures and/or Tables:

- ☐ missing but required
- ☐ not referred to in text
- ☐ caption missing
- ☐ some detail missing

Conclusions:

- ☐ missing
- ☐ incomplete
- ☐ too grand or general
- ☐ general implications should be presented
- ☐ suggestions for further study should be made

Acknowledgments:

- ☐ missing
- ☐ lab partner should be acknowledged

References:

- ☐ missing
- ☐ not used in body
- ☐ must be in order of appearance
- ☐ improperly formatted
- ☐ insufficient references

General Comments:

- ☐ excellent work
- ☐ good work
- ☐ narrative difficult to follow
- ☐ work not properly divided into the various sections
- ☐ too site-specific; write from more general point of view
- ☐ you must type final report

Other Comments: *accept w/o revision* *accept w/minor revision* *accept w/ major revision*